Youtube to Promote Critical Thinking in Critical Listening Course

Ratri Harida[1]

[1]STKIP PGRI Ponorogo

[1]ratri_pbi@stkippgriponorogo.ac.id

Abstract: When it comes to teaching students listening skills, audio-visual learning techniques are superior to audio-only ones. Therefore, YouTube becomes the primary source to get diverse and high quality videos for critical listening courses. In order to better understand the language, students would be able to connect words and images. Using interviews and observation to collect the data, this research found that using YouTube videos has a positive impact on promoting critical thinking while engaging in a critical listening course. Through 1) freeze framing and prediction; 2) repetition and role play; and 3) reproduction activities, YouTube can help students in a critical listening course develop their critical thinking skills. Further advice on how to maximize the advantages of this activity for promoting critical thinking can be found by looking into the various strategies and techniques used by educators to incorporate YouTube videos into their teaching methods.
Keyword: Critical Listening, Critical Thinking, YouTube Video

INTRODUCTION

Pre-service EFL teachers must have the habit of thinking to develop HOTS to be able to assist students in developing the same thinking skills. This habit of thinking involves encouraging critical analysis, problem-solving, and creative thinking among students. By developing these higher-order thinking skills, pre-service EFL teachers can effectively guide their students towards becoming independent and analytical learners (Putra & Abdullah, 2019). As Arwood (2011) said, thinking can connect one concept to another with a series of thinking, speaking, reading, and writing, seeing, listening, and calculating. Increasing thinking ability is more possible if it is discovered, expanded upon, and enriched with experience to the point where it is meaningful.

According to Bers (2005: 16–17), Bloom's taxonomy can be considered an assessment of critical thinking because critical thinking takes place when learners operate in the analysis, synthesis, and evaluation phases. Using a continuum, Bloom's taxonomy (1956) listed the lowest to the highest levels of questions and responses in the thinking process. The levels are: 1) knowledge is the ability to recall specific facts; 2) understanding is the ability to explain in your own words; 3) application is the ability to use information to produce results; 4) analysis is the ability to group things to demonstrate how they are combined; 5) synthesis is the ability to produce an original, one-of-a-kind product; and 6) evaluation is the ability to assign values to various issues.

The first three levels of this system cover lower-order thinking, which is crucial in laying the groundwork for more in-depth comprehension. Higher order thinking skills deal with the final three skills. This level implies that lower-level thinking skills can be successfully applied during the learning process if students use a higher level of thinking. According to Brookhart

(2010), HOTS is the process of transferring a problem before applying critical thinking to find a solution. By implementing critical thinking into the learning process, students are able to deepen their understanding and make connections between different concepts. This integration of lower-level and higher-level thinking promotes a more holistic approach to learning and enhances overall cognitive development.

Critical thinking is not easy to define and may mean different things to various people in different contexts. While some see critical thinking as a broad concept that focuses primarily on the rationale of what to believe or do (Davidson & Dunham, 1997), others see it as more narrowly focused and specific to a particular subject area (McPeck, 1981; Hosseini et al., 2020 in Etemadfar et.al, 2020). Halvorsen (2005:1) proposes another definition of critical thinking as a process when one considers an issue from various perspectives looks at and challenges any potential assumptions that may underlie the issue, and explores its possible alternatives. These different perspectives highlight the complexity of critical thinking and its multidimensional nature (see Arifin, 2018). Critical thinking is not limited to academic settings but is also applicable in everyday life situations, helping individuals make informed decisions and solve problems effectively.

Teaching critical listening, according to Berne, 1995; Chastain, 1979; Harper, 1985; and Richards, 1983 (in Talalakina, 2012), is primarily concerned with teaching comprehension. As a result, the students' exposure to a certain level of difficulty in understanding spoken language during the EFL teaching and learning process for listening skills may occur. According to Chang & Read (2006), the problem arises when EFL students listen to audio that simulates a one-way conversation. In this scenario, the EFL students are unable to interact with the speaker or even see him or her. According to Wuryaningrum et al (2022), critical listening calls for higher order reasoning abilities and the capacity to form conclusions. Therefore, critical listening necessitates the capacity for information construction. While comprehension is undoubtedly a component of critical listening, it goes far beyond it, engaging additional cognitive skills that suggest questioning the information and encouraging further discussion. Thus, when creating instructional listening materials, it is crucial to keep these two factors in mind.

Critical listening skills have a big impact on how well you can learn material (Ferrari Bridgers, Stroumbakis, Drini, Lynch, &Vogel, 2017). That is, if a person has good critical listening skills, they also likely have good general skills. This demonstrates how crucial critical listening is. Lundsteen (in Wuryaningrum et al, 2022) lists the following critical listening skills: (1) differentiating between facts and opinions; (2) exposing assumptions; (3) being receptive to new ideas; (4) relying on reason and common sense; (5) relating new ideas to old ideas; taking notes; and (6) listening morally. These actions suggest there are two components, namely critical thinking skills and critical thinking dispositions. Critical thinking skills refer to the ability to analyze and evaluate information objectively, while critical thinking dispositions encompass the attitudes and habits of mind that facilitate open-mindedness and intellectual curiosity. Developing both components is essential for effective critical listening, as it allows

individuals to actively engage with the information presented, question assumptions, and make informed judgments based on evidence and logical reasoning.

Wilson (2000) and Harmer (2001), cited in Yusroh (2018), contend that audio-visual learning methods are superior to audio-only ones for teaching listening skills to students. Students would be able to make connections between words and images to better understand the language. As long as there is access to the internet, YouTube has a lot to offer, including thousands of manufactured videos that can help students learn more spoken expression through multimedia tools. According to Alwehaibi (2013), simple and free access is another advantage of using YouTube as a learning tool. Another advantage of YouTube's global accessibility is that it gives users access to various world cultures (Kelsen, 2009). These benefits increase YouTube's popularity as a preferred educational tool. Cakir (2006, 69–70) suggested a number of strategies for using video in language instruction that can boost students' motivation, particularly for mastering the four skills: (1) active viewing, which will increase students' participation to comprehend the concepts in the video; (2) freeze framing and prediction; (3) silent viewing (sound off); (4) sound on and vision off; (4) repetition and role play; and (5) reproduction activity (an activity in which students must be able to recall what was said in the video); (6) dubbing activity; and (7) follow up activities.

A study by Etemadfar et al. (2020) on the effects of flipped classrooms on improving Iranian EFL learners' listening comprehension This experimental study ran a pretest and posttest of listening comprehension interviews for the participants in the experimental group. The results revealed significant differences in listening comprehension and critical thinking between both groups, favoring the experimental group. Saputra & Asri (2018) study explores how extensive listening can utilize internet-based media, namely TED and YouTube. This research used participatory action research for EFL freshmen at a state university in Indonesia during the Extensive Listening course. The findings showcase several changes in the teaching-learning circumstances that affect the implementation of in-class activities. The students believed that TED and YouTube helped them expand their vocabulary in English and that the assignments made learning more engaging and less boring. In Aghae & Rad (2018) conducted a study on the relationship between Iranian elementary EFL students' critical thinking and listening comprehension. 40 male and 40 female Iranian EFL students studying at the elementary level participated in the study. Using the listening comprehension test, the results showed that both male and female participants' critical thinking skills and listening comprehension had statistically significant positive relationships. Based on those studies, using Youtube in listening class is recommended. In addition, critical listening also has positive impact for students' critical thinking. Thefore, this study aims to describe how to use YouTube to promote critical thinking while engaging in critical listening course.

METHOD

Since the goal of this research was to change people's lives or places of employment, it employed critical participatory action research. Participants were encouraged to take an active role in the research by actively changing their own behaviors, practices, and the environments in which they work (Kemmis & Nixon, 2014). The research design of the study includes three phases: (1) planning, (2) acting and observing, and (3) reflecting. The research participants are the fourth semester students of English Education Department. Semi-structured interview questions and a class observation form were used to collect the data. Data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing are the methods used in student analysis in order to select the most appropriate data (Miles & Huberman, 1994).

Data reduction

Student interviews and in-class observations provided the data. By outlining the sentences that support Wuryaningrum et al's (2022) theory that listening critically requires higher order thinking and skills with the ability to reason and draw conclusions. The writer used an observation sheet to observe the activities during the teaching and listening processes.

Data Display

The writer reduced some data by choosing only those that related to the necessary data before displaying the excerpts on the table.

Conclusion Drawing

The writer was compelled to take a step back and reflect on the information that has been analyzed from the information display that has been set up in the table and relate it to the research background, theoretical studies, and the objectives of the research or research questions.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Using YouTube to Promote Critical Thinking

The implementation of using YouTube to promote critical thinking in a critical listening course consists of four steps: 1) freeze framing and prediction; 2) repetition and role play; and 3) reproduction activity (see Table 1). The steps of teaching were applied to every meeting. It consisted of three meetings, and after the end of the class, the teacher interviewed the students about their perceptions of the teaching and learning process using YouTube. In addition, the researcher also collected the data by observation as minor data beside the interview.

Table 1: Steps to use Youtube for promote critical thinking

No.	Steps	Practical Activities
1	Freeze framing and prediction	The teacher should pause the video and draw students' attention by asking some questions, discussing a particular scene, closely examining visual and auditory details, and making predictions about what might happen

		next in the video
2	Repetition and role play	Repeatedly listening to specific segments, students can better grasp the nuances of the language and improve their overall understanding. role play in realistic scenarios that simulate real-life conversations based on the video's theme
3	Reproduction activity	An activity in which students are required to be able to recall what was spoken by listening to a recorded dialogue or speech and then reproducing it themselves, either by speaking it out loud or writing it down.

This study was conducted for two months that consists of 6 meetings (each meeting time is 90 minutes). The instructional goals of the lesson follow the syllabus of the course which is to improve automaticity and comprehension of spoken text, to practice listening skills, and to build listening autonomy. The tasks that the researcher set are 1) freeze framing and prediction, 2) repetition and role play, and 3) reproduction activity.

There are three activities that the researchers do at every meeting. Firstly, at the planning stage, lesson plans and teaching materials using YouTube videos were prepared. The first YouTube video used was "What are Stem Cells?" This video tells about the definition, procedure, advantages, and disadvantages of using stem cells for medical purposes. "Racial_Ethnic Prejudice & Discrimination_ Crash Course Sociology #35" was the second video. This video showed the definition, reason, and example of racial and ethnic prejudice and discrimination. The third video, "WATCH_ Weed is legal in New York, but the illegal market is still booming. Here's why?" told about the definition, example, and expert's debate on the legalization of weed in some states in the USA. The fourth video entitled "Why US gun laws get looser after mass shootings". The video told about the mass shooting case, the timeline of mass shooting prevention, and experts' opinions on mass shooting eradication attempts in the USA. A video entitled "Watch One Family's Journey Through A Life-Changing Face Transplant _ National Geographic" was the fifth. It told about the reason, timeline, and opinion of the patient, her parents, and the doctors who were involved in a face transplant. "Death Row in Different Countries (Around the World)" is the last video. It is a descriptive video on the reasons and procedures of death row in ten countries around the world.

Secondly, acting and observing activities were conducted. At this stage, the researchers implemented the lesson plan while collecting data. The researcher played the video, paused it, and drew the students' attention by asking some questions or discussing a particular scene, closely examining visual and auditory elements, and making predictions about what might happen next in the video. Next, the students repeatedly listened to specific segments to improve their comprehension. Then, the students did role play in realistic scenarios that simulate real-life conversations based on the video's theme. Last, the students are required to be able to recall what was said and then reproduce it themselves, either by speaking it out loud or writing it down.

Finally, at the end of the lesson, the students did a reflection on what they did in class and how they felt after the teaching-learning process. At this activity, students were also invited to give suggestions and negotiate the upcoming topics for the next meetings. The students answered the following questions at the end of every three meetings:

(1) How do you feel about the freeze framing and prediction activities in each unit?

(2) How do you feel about the repetition and role play activities in each unit?

(3) How do you feel about reproduction activity in each unit?

(4) How do you feel about the classroom management in each unit?

(5) How do you think about YouTube videos helping you to reason and draw conclusions about the related theme?

The Impacts of Using YouTube to Promote Critical Thinking

This research used a semi-structured interview with the students class observation sheet. The interview gave data on students' perceptions at each meeting of the critical listening course. The class observation sheet provided data on the learning atmosphere, material, and implementation. The observation sheet used a checklist and notes to make the data collection easier. The checklist was about: 1) whether the students did each activity in each meeting; 2) whether the students were actively involved in the discussion in each meeting; and 3) whether the students did the assigned tasks according to the instruction. The lecturer wrote notes on the positive and negative points of the teaching and learning process in each meeting.

Results of Students' Interview

Some results of the students first interview were as follows:

(1) How do you feel about the freeze framing and prediction activities in each unit?

I've never done this activity before, and I'm still not confident in doing it.

This is a new thing for me: learning to listen on YouTube and doing this activity.

It's still a bit boring for me.

(2) How do you feel about the repetition and role play activities in each unit?

The repetition is an old activity, but the role play is a new thing to do in a critical listening course.

The repetition and role-playing visuals also help me understand the words within the video.

The repetition is okay, but the role play is quite hard.

(3) How do you feel about reproduction activity in each unit?

I used to be sleepy when learning to listen. This activity makes me awake.

The activity is quite difficult.

I don't like to write summaries in English. I have limited vocabulary.

(4) How do you think YouTube videos help you reason and draw conclusions about the related theme?

The YouTube video theme introduced me to some new words.

The video provides visuals to help comprehend the meaning of the theme.

The stem cell video is a bit too scientific for me.

(5) How do you feel about the classroom management in each unit?

The teaching atmosphere is fine.

It's a bit different from the regular technique of listening.

So-so, I have a neutral feeling about it.

The result of the first interview with the students showed their rather neutral opinion about the teaching and learning activities during the critical listening course. It seemed they had not complied with the new activities that demanded them to actively discuss and give various responses toward the materials. A student said that the theme was too scientific for an EFL learner. As an EFL learner who is also a future EFL teacher, expanding knowledge on various text themes will be beneficial for material comprehension in future teaching.

Some results of the students second interview were as follows:

(1) How do you feel about the freeze framing and prediction activities in each unit?

I'm already used to this activity and start to enjoy it.

Even though the lecturer still made some errors during the freeze framing, I can deal with the activity better.

I made more correct predictions about the video scenes.

(2) How do you feel about the repetition and role play activities in each unit?

This activity made my pronunciation better.

It's fun. I can act as another character in this session.

The bad thing about this activity is only the role-playing part.

(3) How do you feel about reproduction activity in each unit?

I prefer to have more verbal reproductive activity.

I hope the lecturer gives more times to do the written reproduction activity.

My classmate gave me more work to do when doing group activities in this session.

(4) How do you feel about the classroom management in each unit?

The teaching learning situation was quite joyful and not monotonous.

I love it. Time goes by as if I am not learning.

I like the way the teacher conveys the materials. I think teaching and learning are very conducive.

(5) How do you think YouTube videos help you reason and draw conclusions about the related theme?

The theme gives me more knowledge and expands my vocabulary.

The theme is good and up-to-date.

I learned some shocking facts about the world through the video.

In the second interview, students expressed more positive attitudes toward the use of YouTube to promote critical thinking in the critical listening course. They became more comfortable with the activity. They were also more involved in the discussion and freely expressed their opinions on the theme. They tended to favor giving spoken responses over written responses.

Result of the observation sheet

The results of observation during the six meetings of the implementation are shown in Table 2. The Result of the Observation Sheet.

Table 2: The result of the observation sheet (*∑= 21)

Criteria	Meeting 1	Meeting 2	Meeting 3	Meeting 4	Meeting 5	Meeting 6
Students did each activity in each meeting	15	17	17	19	20	19
Students actively involved in the discussion in each meeting	14	15	14	17	18	18
Students did the assigned tasks according to the instruction	17	15	17	19	19	20

In the first criteria, there was a tendency toward gradual development in the student who did each activity in each meeting. In meeting 1, there were 15 students who did all the activities. Meetings 2 and 3 showed that 17 students did all the activities. In meeting 4, there were 19 students who did all the activities. It increased in meeting 5 with 20 students and reached 19 students in meeting 6. The number of students who are actively involved in the discussion in each meeting also gradually increases. Meeting 1 was 14, meeting 2 was 15, meeting 3 was 14, meeting 4 was 17, meeting 5 was 18, and meeting 6 was 18. The number of students who actively did the assigned tasks according to the instructions in each meeting showed gradual development too. Meeting 1 was 17, meeting 2 was 15, meeting 3 was 17, meeting 4 was 19, meeting 5 was 19, and meeting 6 was 20. Among all the criteria, the number of students who actively participated in the discussion in each meeting was the lowest. The students seemed to lack confidence in participating during the discussion session.

In relation to the observation checklist, the lecturer also took some notes in each meeting. In meeting 1, the lecturer had difficulty pausing the video scene. The students seemed forced to do the activity. Some of them gave no or short responses during the discussion and question-and-answer session. The students gave short responses for the spoken task at the end of the meeting. They did not give any input about the theme for the next meeting. In meeting 2, the students did the activity in a neutral manner. Some of them still gave no or short responses during the discussion and question-and-answer session. The students gave short responses for the written task at the end of the meeting. They still did not give any input about the theme for the next meeting. In meeting 3, pausing the right video scene and giving the proper repetition amount was still a problem. The students were quite interested in the activities. During the discussion and question-and-answer session, almost all students tried to give responses. The

students still gave short responses for the spoken task at the end of the meeting. They proposed drug legalization as the theme for the next meeting.

The students' positive attitudes continued in meeting 4. They seemed to be more relaxed and free to speak their minds about the theme of each activity. Yet they gave short written responses to the reproduction activity. In meeting 5, the students quite enjoyed each activity. They started to have a more logical and elaborate discussion. Since the students gave longer responses in spoken mode, the lecturer decided to give more spoken tasks in the reproduction activity. In the last meeting, the students actively discussed, role-played, and gave various responses to the materials. The lecturer observed that the students' engagement and participation levels significantly increased during the reproduction activity. This indicated that incorporating more spoken tasks was effective in encouraging the students to express their thoughts and ideas more fluently. Additionally, the diverse range of responses provided by the students showcased their ability to critically analyze and apply the materials in different contexts.

CONCLUSION

Based on the research findings, using YouTube videos has a positive impact on promoting critical thinking while engaging in a critical listening course. One way to use YouTube to promote critical thinking while engaging in a critical listening course, is by assigning students to watch and analyze videos that present different perspectives on a specific topic. In this study, it starts when the lecturer pauses the video and draws students' attention by asking some questions, discussing a particular scene, closely examining visual and auditory details, and making predictions about what might happen next in the video. This activity's goal is to encourage the students to critically evaluate the arguments presented, identify logical fallacies or biases, and provide evidence-based counterarguments. The next step is to repeatedly listen to specific segments so students can better grasp the nuances of the language and improve their overall understanding. It then followed by role play activity in realistic scenarios that simulate real-life conversations based on the video's theme. The last activity is the reproduction activity, an activity in which students are required to be able to recall what was spoken by listening to a recorded dialogue or speech and then reproducing it themselves, either by speaking it out loud or writing it down. In this activity, the students are required to critically assess the credibility of the sources used in YouTube videos and compare them with scholarly resources. \

Further research on the detailed and varied activities to promote videos can provide valuable insights into the effectiveness of this approach in enhancing students' analytical skills. Another activity to promote critical thinking using Youtube can include analyzing the accuracy of the information presented, evaluating the expertise of the video creators, and identifying any biases or agendas that may be present. Exploring different strategies and techniques employed by educators to incorporate YouTube videos into their teaching methods can offer further guidance on how to maximize the benefits of this activity for fostering critical thinking.

REFERENCES

Aghaei, K. & Rad, E. M. (2018). On the Interconnection between Bloom's Critical Thinking Taxonomy & Listening Comprehension Performance of Iranian EFL Learners. *International Journal of English Language & Translation Studies*, 6(3), pp. 22-31. Retrieved online from http://www.eltsjournal.org

Alwehaibi, H. O. (2013). The Impact of Using Youtube in EFL Classroom in Enhancing EFL Students" Content Learning. *Journal of College Teaching & Learning*, 12(2), pp. 935-940. Retrieved online from https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1061416

Arifin, A. (2018). *Enhancing Teacher and Learners' Critical Literacy in Indonesian EFL Context: Working with Hoax*. International Conference on English Language Teaching and Research (ELTAR) 1, pp. 162-168. Malang: Unisma.

Arwood, E. L. (2011). *Language Function an Introduction to Pragmatic Assessment and Intervention for Higher Order Thinking and Better Literacy*. Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Bers, T. (2005). Assessing Critical Thinking in Community Colleges. *New Directions for Community Colleges*, 130, pp. 15-25. Retrieved online from https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ761031

Bloom, B. (1956). *A Taxonomy of Educational Objectives*. *Handbook I: Cognitive Domain*. New York: McKay.

Brookhart, S. M. (2010). *Assess Higher Order Thingking Skills in Your Classroom*. Alexandria: ASCD.

Cakir, I. (2006). The Use of Video as an Audio-Visual Material in Foreign Language Teaching Classroom. *The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 5(4), pp. 67-73. Retrieved online from http://www.tojet.net/articles/v5i4/549.pdf

Chang, A. & Read J. (2006). The Effects of Listening Support on the Listening Performance of EFL Learners. *TESOL Quarterly*, 40(2), pp. 375-397. Doi: https://doi.org/10.2307/40264527

Davidson, B. & Dunham, R. (1997). Assessing EFL Student Progress in Critical Thinking with the Ennis-Weir Critical Thinking Essay Test. *JALT Journal*, 19(1), pp. 43–57. Retrieved online from https://jalt-publications.org

Etemadfar, P., Soozandehfar, S. M. A. & Namaziandost, E. (2020). An Account of EFL Learners' Listening Comprehension and Critical Thinking in the Flipped Classroom Model. *Cogent Education*, 7(1), pp. 1-22 Doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2020.1835150

Ferrari-Bridgers, F., Stroumbakis, K., Drini, M., Lynch, B., & Vogel, R. (2017). Assessing Critical-Analytical Listening Skills in Math and Engineering Students: An Exploratory Inquiry of How Analytical Listening Skills can Positively Impact Learning. *International Journal of Listening*, 31(3), pp. 121-141. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/10904018.2016.1222910

Halvorsen, A. (2005). Incorporating Critical Thinking Skills Development in to ESL/EFL Courses. *Internet TESL Journal*, 11(3), pp. 45–61. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2020.1835150

Kelsen, B. (2009). Teaching EFL to the iGeneration: A Survey of Using YouTube as Supplementary Material with College EFL Students in Taiwan. *CALL-EJ Online,* 10(2), pp. 1-18. Retrieved online from http://callej.org/journal/10-2/Kelsen2009.pdf

Kemmis, S., Mctaggart, R., & Nixon, R. (2014). *The Action Research Planner: Doing Critical Participatory Action Research*. Singapore: Springer. Doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-981-4560-67-2

Miles, M. B. & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*. California: Sage Publications.

Putra, T. K. & Abdullah, D. F. (2019). Higher-Order Thinking Skill (HOTS) Questions in English National Examination in Indonesia. *Lingua Scientia*, 11(1), pp. 145-160. Doi: https://doi.org/10.21274/ls.2019.11.1.145-160

Saputra, Y. & Asri, S. F. (2018). The Use of TED and Youtube in Extensive Listening Course: Exploring Possibilities of Autonomy Learning. *Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching*, 13(1), pp. 73-84. Doi: https://doi.org/10.25170/ijelt.v13i1.1451

Talalakina, E. V. (2012). *Audiobook in Advanced ESL Classroom: Developing Critical Listening*. 5th Pixel International Conference 'ICT for Language Learning.' Retrieved online from https://conference.pixel-online.net

Wuryaningrum, R., Muti'ah, A. & Rijadi, A. (2022). Critical Listening: Teacher Language Awareness (TLA). *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention,* 9(04), pp. 6874-6878. Doi: https://doi.org/10.18535/ijsshi/v9i04.01%20

Yusroh, M. (2018). The Use of Audio-Visual Aids in EFL Students' Listening skills of IAII Genteng Banyuwangi. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa*, 7(1), pp. 90-103. Doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.31571/bahasa.v7i1.829